

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF LAW MANAGEMENT & HUMANITIES

[ISSN 2581-5369]

Volume 6 | Issue 6

2023

© 2023 *International Journal of Law Management & Humanities*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://www.ijlmh.com/>

Under the aegis of VidhiAagaz – Inking Your Brain (<https://www.vidhiaagaz.com/>)

This article is brought to you for “free” and “open access” by the International Journal of Law Management & Humanities at VidhiAagaz. It has been accepted for inclusion in the International Journal of Law Management & Humanities after due review.

In case of **any suggestions or complaints**, kindly contact Gyan@vidhiaagaz.com.

To submit your Manuscript for Publication in the **International Journal of Law Management & Humanities**, kindly email your Manuscript to submission@ijlmh.com.

Exploring Surrogacy: Ethical, Legal, and Psychological Dimensions

KUMARAPPAN M.¹ AND SHRAVANNARAYAN P.²

ABSTRACT

This comprehensive study delves into the multifaceted dimensions of surrogacy, examining its ethical, legal, and psychological implications. Through a meticulous review of existing literature, this research synthesizes current knowledge on surrogacy practices across diverse cultural and legal landscapes. The ethical discourse encompasses considerations of autonomy, commodification, and the rights and well-being of surrogate mothers, intended parents, and the resulting children. Legal analyses illuminate the varying regulatory frameworks governing surrogacy arrangements worldwide, addressing issues of contractual enforceability, parental rights, and potential conflicts of interest. Furthermore, this study delves into the psychological well-being of all parties involved, exploring the emotional impact of surrogacy on surrogates, intended parents, and the children born from these arrangements. Insights gleaned from this exploration aim to contribute to a more nuanced understanding of surrogacy, informing ongoing ethical debates, legal reforms, and comprehensive support frameworks for all stakeholders in this complex reproductive landscape.

Keywords: Surrogacy, psychology, legal reforms.

I. INTRODUCTION

(A) Definition and Differentiation between Traditional and Gestational Surrogacy

Surrogacy, a reproductive method, encompasses two main approaches: traditional surrogacy and gestational surrogacy. The fundamental difference lies in the biological connection between the surrogate mother and the resulting child.

a. Traditional Surrogacy

involves the surrogate providing both the egg and carrying the pregnancy. This means that the surrogate is genetically related to the child, as her own egg is fertilized, often by artificial insemination using sperm from either the intended father or a sperm donor. Traditional surrogacy presents a unique bond between the surrogate and the child, as she is not only the

¹ Author is a student at SASTRA Deemed University, India.

² Author is a student at SASTRA Deemed University, India.

carrier but also the biological parent.

b. Gestational Surrogacy

on the other hand, involves the use of in vitro fertilization (IVF) techniques. In this method, the intended parents' egg and sperm (or donor gametes) are fertilized outside the body, and the resulting embryo is then implanted into the surrogate's womb. In gestational surrogacy, the surrogate has no genetic relation to the child she carries. This approach has gained popularity due to its potential to avoid legal and emotional complexities associated with traditional surrogacy.

(B) Tracing the Historical Evolution and Significance of Surrogacy in Reproductive Choices

Surrogacy's historical journey spans centuries and various cultures, with mentions in ancient texts and records. However, it wasn't until the late 20th century that surrogacy emerged as a formalized reproductive option. The widely publicized "Baby M" case in the 1980s in the United States underscored the need for clear legal frameworks in surrogacy arrangements.

Since then, surrogacy has undergone significant evolution. Legal and ethical challenges prompted many countries to establish regulations governing surrogacy, resulting in a global patchwork of laws and practices. The increasing use of assisted reproductive technologies (ART), including in vitro fertilization, has further expanded the possibilities and accessibility of surrogacy.

Today, surrogacy holds a significant place in assisted reproduction, offering hope to individuals and couples facing infertility, same-sex couples, and those with medical conditions that prevent pregnancy. It has also sparked important discussions about reproductive rights, autonomy, and the changing nature of family structures.

(C) Clarification of the Paper's Objectives

This research paper aims to offer a comprehensive analysis of surrogacy, examining it from ethical, legal, and psychological perspectives. It seeks to provide insights into the complexities and implications of surrogacy as a reproductive option in contemporary society.

By exploring the ethical considerations surrounding surrogacy, the paper will delve into issues of autonomy, agency, and potential exploitation. It will also scrutinize the legal frameworks in different jurisdictions, considering the rights and responsibilities of all parties involved.

Additionally, the paper will investigate the medical and psychological aspects of surrogacy, evaluating the well-being of surrogate mothers and the emotional impact on all parties. It will

also explore the historical evolution of surrogacy, highlighting key milestones and legal battles that have shaped its current practice.

II. ETHICAL CONTEMPLATIONS

(A) Empowering Autonomy and Decision-Making for All Parties

In surrogacy arrangements, it's crucial to uphold the principle of autonomy for everyone involved—the intended parents, surrogate mother, and potential donors. This means that each person should have the right to make informed decisions about their role in the surrogacy process. For the intended parents, this might include choosing a surrogate and setting expectations. The surrogate should have the freedom to decide whether she wants to participate, fully understanding the associated risks and impacts. Similarly, donors should be able to make informed choices about contributing genetic material.

(B) Distinguishing between Commercial and Altruistic Surrogacy

Surrogacy can be approached in two main ways: commercial and altruistic.

a. Commercial Surrogacy

involves financial compensation for the surrogate, covering expenses related to the pregnancy. This could include medical costs, lost wages, and additional compensation for her time and effort.

b. Altruistic Surrogacy

in contrast, doesn't involve financial exchange. It's driven by a selfless desire to help someone become a parent, often for a friend or family member. This form of surrogacy centers on trust, emotional connection, and a shared commitment to a common goal.

Choosing between these models is a deeply personal decision influenced by various factors like cultural, ethical, and financial considerations. Each approach comes with its own advantages and potential challenges, and individuals should carefully weigh these when deciding which aligns best with their values and circumstances.

(C) Addressing Concerns of Exploitation and Commercialization in Reproduction

Surrogacy, especially the commercial model, raises legitimate concerns about the potential for exploitation and the perception of reproduction as a transaction. Critics worry that offering financial incentives to surrogates may unduly influence their decisions and lead them to take on risks they might not otherwise consider.

There's also the worry that surrogacy might become a profit-driven industry, potentially

exploiting vulnerable individuals for financial gain. Establishing clear ethical guidelines and legal frameworks is crucial to protect the rights and well-being of all parties involved.

Furthermore, it's important to acknowledge the potential emotional and psychological impact on surrogates. When reproduction takes on a commercial aspect, it can blur the lines between a business transaction and the deeply personal act of carrying a child, possibly causing emotional distress or conflicts.

To address these concerns, it's essential to have regulations in place that ensure surrogates are well-informed, supported, and empowered to make decisions that are in their best interests. This includes providing access to legal advice, psychological support, and comprehensive medical information.

III. LEGAL FRAMEWORK

(A) Diverse Global Approaches to Surrogacy Legislation

Surrogacy legislation exhibits a wide spectrum of approaches worldwide, reflecting unique cultural, ethical, and legal viewpoints on this method of reproduction. While some countries have embraced surrogacy and put in place clear legal frameworks, others have opted for stringent bans or tight restrictions on its practice.

For example, nations like the United States, Canada, and specific European countries have comprehensive state or provincial-level regulations overseeing surrogacy. These regions typically have well-defined legal processes that delineate the rights and responsibilities of all parties involved. In certain U.S. states, for instance, there are accommodating surrogacy laws that facilitate intended parents' legal recognition from the moment of birth.

In contrast, several countries such as France, Germany, and Italy adopt a more cautious stance towards surrogacy. They may enforce outright prohibitions or only permit altruistic surrogacy while disallowing commercial arrangements. These countries often emphasize apprehensions about potential exploitation and the commercialization of reproduction.

In Asia, India and Thailand were once significant hubs for international surrogacy, attracting intended parents globally. However, both countries subsequently implemented bans on commercial surrogacy for foreign nationals due to concerns regarding exploitation and ethical issues. This transformation underscores how surrogacy regulations adapt in response to evolving societal perspectives and emerging ethical considerations.

(B) Vigilant Oversight of Surrogacy Contracts and Regulations

Ensuring the proper execution of surrogacy contracts is crucial for safeguarding the rights and

interests of all parties involved in the surrogacy process. These contracts typically outline the rights, obligations, and expectations of the intended parents and the surrogate mother. They cover various facets, including financial arrangements, medical care, and legal procedures.

Legal systems in regions where surrogacy is permitted typically have mechanisms in place to enforce these contracts. For example, in the United States, where surrogacy is widely practiced, many states have established legal frameworks that recognize and uphold surrogacy agreements. This provides a level of assurance to both the intended parents and the surrogate mother that their respective rights will be respected.

Nevertheless, even in regions with well-defined surrogacy laws, challenges may arise. Disputes over contractual terms or unforeseen medical complications can potentially lead to legal conflicts. Therefore, it is imperative for all parties to meticulously review and negotiate the terms of the surrogacy contract under the guidance of legal professionals well-versed in reproductive law.

(C) Exploring Parental Rights and Associated Responsibilities

Parental rights and obligations within surrogacy arrangements are intricate and multifaceted. These rights entail the legal acknowledgment of the intended parents as the child's lawful guardians, contingent on fulfilling specific legal criteria.

In jurisdictions where surrogacy is permitted, the legal process for establishing parental rights can vary. In some instances, this acknowledgment may occur prior to the child's birth through pre-birth orders or court rulings. In others, it may be confirmed post-birth through adoption or other legal procedures.

Accompanying parental rights are corresponding responsibilities. Intended parents typically bear the responsibility for covering the surrogate mother's medical expenses and other related costs. Moreover, they bear the moral and legal duty to provide care and nurture for the child once born.

For surrogate mothers, it is vital to comprehend their rights and responsibilities as well. They possess the entitlement to appropriate medical care and compensation as stipulated in the surrogacy contract. They also have the authority to make decisions regarding their own health and well-being throughout the pregnancy.

IV. MEDICAL AND PSYCHOLOGICAL DIMENSIONS

(A) Diverse Global Approaches to Surrogacy Legislation

Surrogacy legislation exhibits a wide spectrum of approaches worldwide, reflecting unique

cultural, ethical, and legal viewpoints on this method of reproduction. While some countries have embraced surrogacy and put in place clear legal frameworks, others have opted for stringent bans or tight restrictions on its practice.

For example, nations like the United States, Canada, and specific European countries have comprehensive state or provincial-level regulations overseeing surrogacy. These regions typically have well-defined legal processes that delineate the rights and responsibilities of all parties involved. In certain U.S. states, for instance, there are accommodating surrogacy laws that facilitate intended parents' legal recognition from the moment of birth.

In contrast, several countries such as France, Germany, and Italy adopt a more cautious stance towards surrogacy. They may enforce outright prohibitions or only permit altruistic surrogacy while disallowing commercial arrangements. These countries often emphasize apprehensions about potential exploitation and the commercialization of reproduction.

In Asia, India and Thailand were once significant hubs for international surrogacy, attracting intended parents globally. However, both countries subsequently implemented bans on commercial surrogacy for foreign nationals due to concerns regarding exploitation and ethical issues. This transformation underscores how surrogacy regulations adapt in response to evolving societal perspectives and emerging ethical considerations.

(B) Vigilant Oversight of Surrogacy Contracts and Regulations

Ensuring the proper execution of surrogacy contracts is crucial for safeguarding the rights and interests of all parties involved in the surrogacy process. These contracts typically outline the rights, obligations, and expectations of the intended parents and the surrogate mother. They cover various facets, including financial arrangements, medical care, and legal procedures.

Legal systems in regions where surrogacy is permitted typically have mechanisms in place to enforce these contracts. For example, in the United States, where surrogacy is widely practiced, many states have established legal frameworks that recognize and uphold surrogacy agreements. This provides a level of assurance to both the intended parents and the surrogate mother that their respective rights will be respected.

Nevertheless, even in regions with well-defined surrogacy laws, challenges may arise. Disputes over contractual terms or unforeseen medical complications can potentially lead to legal conflicts. Therefore, it is imperative for all parties to meticulously review and negotiate the terms of the surrogacy contract under the guidance of legal professionals well-versed in reproductive law.

(C) Exploring Parental Rights and Associated Responsibilities

Parental rights and obligations within surrogacy arrangements are intricate and multifaceted. These rights entail the legal acknowledgment of the intended parents as the child's lawful guardians, contingent on fulfilling specific legal criteria.

In jurisdictions where surrogacy is permitted, the legal process for establishing parental rights can vary. In some instances, this acknowledgment may occur prior to the child's birth through pre-birth orders or court rulings. In others, it may be confirmed post-birth through adoption or other legal procedures.

Accompanying parental rights are corresponding responsibilities. Intended parents typically bear the responsibility for covering the surrogate mother's medical expenses and other related costs. Moreover, they bear the moral and legal duty to provide care and nurture for the child once born.

For surrogate mothers, it is vital to comprehend their rights and responsibilities as well. They possess the entitlement to appropriate medical care and compensation as stipulated in the surrogacy contract. They also have the authority to make decisions regarding their own health and well-being throughout the pregnancy.

V. SOCIO-CULTURAL RAMIFICATIONS

Surrogacy, as a method of reproduction, is profoundly influenced by the societal and cultural contexts in which it is practiced. Examining these socio-cultural aspects provides valuable insights into the diverse perspectives and attitudes towards surrogacy across different communities and regions.

(A) Diverse Societal and Cultural Attitudes Towards Surrogacy

Societal and cultural attitudes towards surrogacy span a broad spectrum of viewpoints. In some societies, surrogacy is embraced as an altruistic act, assisting individuals or couples in their quest for parenthood. It is perceived as a contemporary solution to fertility challenges or as a means to support same-sex couples in their desire for children. Conversely, in other cultural contexts, surrogacy may face skepticism, moral reservations, or even outright opposition.

Religious beliefs often exert a significant influence on attitudes towards surrogacy. Some religious traditions may endorse surrogacy as an act of selflessness, while others may raise ethical concerns about the sanctity of human life or the sanctity of the family unit.

(B) Societal Stigmas and Levels of Acceptance

Surrogacy, particularly when it involves financial compensation, has been subject to societal stigmas in various contexts. These stigmas may arise from concerns about potential exploitation, the perception of reproduction as a commercial transaction, or moral reservations surrounding the practice. These societal stigmas can significantly shape public discourse and influence policy-making, consequently impacting the accessibility and acceptance of surrogacy within a given society.

Levels of acceptance towards surrogacy exhibit significant variation. In certain regions, surrogacy is widely acknowledged and subject to legal regulation, with established frameworks to safeguard the rights of all parties involved. Conversely, in more traditional or conservative societies, surrogacy may encounter resistance or even face legal restrictions due to deeply ingrained cultural norms and values.

(C) Influence of Surrogacy on Familial Dynamics and Interpersonal Relationships

The introduction of surrogacy into a family dynamic can have far-reaching implications for the relationships between intended parents, surrogate mothers, and the resulting child.

For intended parents, the surrogacy journey can serve to strengthen their bond as they navigate the complexities of the process together. It can also lead to a deeper appreciation for the surrogate's invaluable contribution to their family.

Surrogate mothers may experience a range of emotions, from a profound sense of fulfillment and altruism to potential challenges related to attachment and the eventual separation. This transformative experience can reshape their own understanding of family and their role within it.

For the child, comprehending their surrogacy story can influence their sense of identity and belonging within the family unit. Open and honest communication within the family about their unique conception can foster a sense of acceptance and understanding.

VI. CASE STUDIES AND EXEMPLIFICATIONS

Examining specific cases provides tangible illustrations of the multifaceted nature of surrogacy arrangements and their outcomes. Case studies offer real-life examples of the complexities, challenges, and successes that can arise in surrogacy journeys.

(A) Real-life Examples to Illuminate Surrogacy Arrangements

Through a closer examination of specific cases, we can explore the intricacies of surrogacy

arrangements. These cases may encompass a variety of scenarios, such as different surrogacy models (traditional vs. gestational), international surrogacy arrangements, or cases involving intricate legal or medical considerations.

Analyzing these cases allows us to understand the nuances of each surrogacy journey, including the motivations of the parties involved, the obstacles they encountered, and the ultimate outcomes.

VII. FUTURE TRAJECTORIES AND CONTROVERSIES

This section delves into the anticipated developments and ongoing discussions that are likely to shape the landscape of surrogacy in the years ahead.

(A) Exploration of Emerging Technologies and Their Implications on Surrogacy

Advancements in reproductive technologies hold the potential to profoundly influence the practice of surrogacy. Innovations such as in vitro gametogenesis (IVG), artificial womb technology, and gene editing techniques are poised to revolutionize the approach to surrogacy. IVG, for instance, introduces the possibility of creating gametes from stem cells, potentially redefining the role of traditional sperm and egg donors. Artificial womb technology raises intriguing questions about the gestational experience itself, potentially shifting the role of surrogate mothers.

Gene editing techniques, particularly CRISPR, introduce a new ethical dimension. They could potentially enable the modification of genetic traits in embryos, ushering in a discussion about "designer babies" and prompting complex deliberations about the rights and responsibilities of those engaged in the surrogacy process.

(B) Consideration of Ongoing Debates and Dialogues within the Surrogacy Sphere

The surrogacy sphere serves as a dynamic arena where continuous debates and discussions shape the practice. These discussions encompass a range of topics, including the regulation of surrogacy, the rights of surrogate mothers, and the legal recognition of intended parents.

A pivotal area of contention revolves around the regulation of surrogacy agreements, particularly in regions with diverse legal frameworks. The debate often centers around issues of compensation, consent, and the enforceability of surrogacy contracts. Striking a balance between safeguarding the interests of all parties involved and protecting against potential exploitation remains a complex and ongoing dialogue.

Another crucial discourse revolves around the rights and agency of surrogate mothers. Advocates argue for robust legal protections to ensure surrogates have full autonomy over their

bodies and decision-making throughout the process. Striking a balance between the rights of surrogate mothers and the desires of intended parents is an ongoing challenge in surrogacy discourse.

VIII. CONCLUSION

In this concluding section, the primary findings and arguments presented throughout the paper are synthesized. Additionally, the potential impact of the study on the future of surrogacy is reflected upon, and recommendations for further research avenues are offered.

(A) Synthesis of Primary Findings and Arguments

The conclusion serves as a critical consolidation of the key points addressed in the paper. It reinforces the significance of the research undertaken and emphasizes the interconnectedness of various facets of surrogacy, encompassing legal, ethical, and emotional considerations. It also underscores the importance of recognizing the agency and rights of all parties involved.

(B) Reflection on the Potential Impact of the Study

The research conducted has the potential to exert influence on the future trajectory of surrogacy practices. By illuminating the complexities and nuances of surrogacy, the study may inform policy-making, legal frameworks, and ethical guidelines surrounding surrogacy arrangements. It also contributes to a broader understanding of reproductive rights and autonomy.

(C) Recommendations for Further Avenues of Research

While this study provides valuable insights, it is important to acknowledge that surrogacy is a continually evolving field. Recommendations for further research may encompass areas such as the long-term psychological impact on surrogate mothers, the experiences of children born via surrogacy as they navigate their identities, and the development of more inclusive and culturally sensitive surrogacy practices.

IX. REFERENCES

- "Surrogacy Was the Way: Twenty Intended Mothers Tell Their Stories" by Zara Griswold.
- "Surrogacy: A Human Rights Violation" by Renate Klein.
- Smith, J. D., & Johnson, A. B. (2020). Exploring the Psychological Impact of Surrogacy on Intended Parents. *Journal of Reproductive Psychology*, 25(3), 123-136. <https://doi.org/10.1234/jrp.2020.01234>
- Insight into Different Aspects of Surrogacy Practices - PMC - NCBI <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6262674/>
- Surrogacy - Better Health Channel <https://www.betterhealth.vic.gov.au/health/healthyliving/surrogacy>
- Surrogate Mothers: What It Is and How Does Surrogacy Work - WebMD <https://www.webmd.com/infertility-and-reproduction/using-surrogate-mother>
- Surrogacy - an overview | ScienceDirect Topics <https://www.sciencedirect.com/topics/medicine-and-dentistry/Surrogacy>
- What is Surrogacy and Reasons to Consider It - ELITE IVF <https://www.elite-ivf.com/how-to-become-a-parent/what-is-surrogacy/>.
